



## A Systematic Review of Reading Strategies for EFL Learners with Low Proficiency in Indonesian Senior High Schools

Umi Astuti\*, Nyimas Triyana Safitri, Rosinta Norawati

Master Program of English Language Education Jambi State University 36122, Indonesia

### ARTICLE INFO

#### Article history:

Received: 28 Nov 2025

Revised: 19 Des 2025

Accepted: 05 Jan 2026

Published online: 20 Jan 2026

#### Keywords:

EFL,  
Low Proficiency,  
Reading Strategies,  
Senior High School,  
Systematic Review

#### \* Corresponding author:

E-mail: [umiastuti2901@gmail.com](mailto:umiastuti2901@gmail.com)

#### Article Doi:

<https://doi.org/10.31258/jes.10.1.p.1969-1984>

This is an open access article under the [CC BY-SA](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/4.0/) license.



### ABSTRACT

This paper presents a systematic literature review examining the effectiveness of various reading strategies tailored for English as a Foreign Language (EFL) students with limited proficiency in Indonesian senior high schools. Despite reading being a foundational skill in EFL contexts, numerous national assessments continue to reveal widespread difficulties in reading comprehension among these learners. The review aims to identify practical, research-supported approaches that enhance reading engagement and achievement. Utilizing the PRISMA framework, a total of peer-reviewed articles published from 2014 to 2024 were analyzed, sourced from Scopus, ERIC, and Google Scholar. The quality of each article was assessed using a simplified CASP (Critical Appraisal Skills Programme) framework to ensure methodological rigor and relevance. The review identifies five primary strategies: repeated reading, reciprocal teaching, partner reading, the use of graphic organizers, and digital-based reading tools. These approaches were found to contribute significantly to learner comprehension, motivation, and confidence, particularly in low-proficiency EFL classroom settings.

## 1. Introduction

In English as a Foreign Language (EFL) classrooms, reading plays a pivotal role not only in supporting students' academic achievement but also in fostering independent learning and long-term language development. As a receptive skill, reading provides learners with sustained exposure to vocabulary, grammatical structures, and discourse patterns that are essential for developing overall language competence, particularly in educational contexts where English is rarely used as a medium of daily communication. Within the Indonesian education system, reading has received substantial attention due to its strong association with students'

performance in national examinations and international large-scale assessments. Despite this emphasis, reading comprehension remains a major challenge for many Indonesian senior high school students, as evidenced by consistently low achievement levels reported across assessment cycles. These findings indicate that instructional emphasis alone is insufficient if it is not accompanied by pedagogical strategies that are responsive to learners' proficiency levels and instructional contexts.

The difficulties experienced by Indonesian senior high school students are particularly pronounced among learners with low English proficiency. These students frequently struggle with limited vocabulary knowledge, insufficient grammatical awareness, weak decoding skills, low reading fluency, and minimal exposure to English beyond the classroom environment, all of which significantly hinder their ability to construct meaning from written texts (Nuraini & Syafran, 2019). International research similarly suggests that many reading strategy interventions implicitly assume learners possess intermediate language proficiency and adequate word recognition skills. For low-proficiency EFL learners, however, constraints in oral language development, decoding accuracy, and fluency often prevent the effective application of higher-order comprehension strategies, resulting in limited instructional impact (August & Shanahan, 2006; National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine, 2018; Education Endowment Foundation, 2021).

Evidence from large-scale international assessments further underscores the persistence of reading challenges among adolescents. Findings from the Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA) consistently place Indonesia among the lowest-performing countries in reading literacy, reflecting ongoing difficulties in students' ability to interpret, evaluate, and reflect on written texts (OECD, 2019). Beyond PISA, results from PIRLS reveal that a substantial proportion of students in multilingual and lower-resourced contexts fail to reach the minimum benchmark for reading comprehension, pointing to systemic weaknesses in foundational reading skills that underpin later academic success (IEA PIRLS 2021 Report). In response, international practice guides emphasize that reading instruction for low-proficiency learners should integrate explicit teaching of decoding, fluency, and vocabulary with scaffolded comprehension and metacognitive strategy instruction, rather than relying solely on strategy-based approaches (Education Endowment Foundation, 2021; What Works Clearinghouse, Adolescent Literacy Practice Guide).

Despite the expanding body of research on reading instruction in EFL contexts, existing studies and reviews predominantly focus on general EFL populations or tertiary-level learners, with comparatively limited attention given to low-proficiency secondary students, particularly those in public, suburban, or under-resourced schools. Moreover, there remains a scarcity of systematic reviews that synthesize empirical evidence on reading strategies specifically tailored for low-proficiency EFL learners at the senior high school level within Indonesian or comparable Global South contexts. Most prior reviews address broad strategy instruction, ESL or bilingual education in high-income settings, or adult and

---

---

university learners, leaving a gap in context-sensitive and evidence-based guidance for secondary school teachers. To address this gap, the present study conducts a PRISMA-guided systematic literature review of 30 peer-reviewed articles published between 2014 and 2024, critically appraised using a simplified CASP framework, with the aim of identifying effective reading strategies, key implementation features, and contextual considerations relevant to improving reading instruction for Indonesian senior high school EFL learners.

## **2. Methodology**

This study employed a Systematic Literature Review (SLR) design that was rigorously guided by the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses (PRISMA) framework to ensure transparency, replicability, and methodological coherence. The review proceeded through three major stages: planning, conducting, and reporting which collectively structured the process of determining the research focus, developing inclusion and exclusion criteria, and systematically retrieving relevant studies from reputable academic databases. During the planning stage, the researchers formulated the review protocol, identified key concepts related to reading strategies and low-proficiency learners, and established quality appraisal indicators.

The conducting stage involved comprehensive database searches, screening procedures using the PRISMA flowchart, and the extraction of empirical evidence from studies published within the set timeframe. Finally, the reporting stage synthesized the findings into thematic categories and evaluated their implications for EFL teaching practice. Through these interconnected steps, the review sought to systematically collect, appraise, and synthesize empirical studies that examined reading strategies for low-proficiency English as a Foreign Language (EFL) learners in Indonesian senior high school contexts, thereby providing an evidence-based foundation for pedagogical decision-making.

## **3. Results and Discussion**

Well-prepared tables and or figures must be of significant feature of this section, because they convey the major observations to readers. Any information provided in tables and figures should no longer be repeated in the text, but the text should focus on the importance of the principal findings of the study. In general, journal papers will contain three-seven figures and tables. The same data can not be presented in the form of tables and figures. The results of the study are discussed to address the problem formulated, objectives and research hypotheses. It is highly suggested that discussion be focused on the why and how of the research findings and to extend to which the research findings can be applied to other relevant problems.

---

### ***Planning Phase***

The research questions were formulated, inclusion and exclusion criteria defined, and the review scope delimited to studies relevant to Southeast Asian educational settings or comparable EFL contexts. The inclusion criteria were:

1. Participants were EFL senior high school students (grades 10–12).
2. Learners were categorized as having low English proficiency.
3. The study examined reading strategies with measurable learning outcomes.
4. The article was peer-reviewed, written in English, and published between 2014–2024.
5. Full-text was accessible online.

The exclusion criteria were:

- Studies in primary or tertiary education.
- Conceptual papers without empirical data.
- Conference proceedings, book chapters, magazines, reports, or unpublished theses/dissertations (including undergraduate theses and master's theses).
- Duplicate publications.
- Studies lacking methodological clarity or not directly focused on reading strategies.

### ***Search Strategy***

The search strategy for this systematic review was conducted in a structured and replicable manner using three major academic databases, namely Scopus, ERIC, and Google Scholar, which were selected for their extensive coverage of peer-reviewed publications in education, applied linguistics, and English as a Foreign Language (EFL) research. To identify studies that specifically addressed reading strategies for low-proficiency EFL learners at the secondary school level, a range of carefully constructed keywords and Boolean operators were employed. Search strings included combinations such as “EFL reading strategies” AND “low proficiency” AND “high school” AND “Indonesia,” alongside alternative terms and related descriptors that were tested during the preliminary search phase to maximize retrieval accuracy and minimize omission of relevant studies. The systematic use of Boolean operators enabled the development of precise query patterns that filtered out irrelevant publications while retaining studies that aligned closely with the objectives of the review. To ensure the relevance and timeliness of the evidence base, the search was restricted to articles published between 2014 and 2024. Additional inclusion filters, including peer-reviewed status, English-language publication, and full-text accessibility, were also applied to further enhance the methodological rigor and quality of the selected literature.

### ***Study Selection***

The study selection process followed the structured PRISMA guidelines to ensure transparency and methodological rigor throughout the screening stages. The initial database search resulted in a total of 147 retrieved articles. Following this, 32 duplicate records were identified and removed, leaving 115 unique studies for the title and abstract screening phase. During this stage, each article was evaluated

---

against the predefined inclusion criteria, which resulted in the exclusion of 60 studies that did not focus on reading strategies, did not involve low-proficiency EFL learners, or were conducted outside the senior high school context. The remaining 55 articles proceeded to full-text assessment, where a more detailed evaluation was carried out to determine their methodological soundness, relevance, and alignment with the scope of the review. This in-depth screening led to the exclusion of an additional 25 studies due to issues such as insufficient methodological rigor, unclear research design, or misalignment with the target population. Ultimately, 30 articles met all criteria and were included in the final synthesis. A summary of the Study Selection Process Based on PRISMA shown in Table 1.

Table 1. A summary of the Study Selection Process Based on PRISMA

Stage	Number of Articles
Identified through database search	147
Removed due to duplication	32
Screened (title & abstract)	115
Excluded after screening	60
Full-text articles assessed	55
Articles excluded (irrelevant focus/methodological issues)	25
Final studies included	30

### Data Extraction

A standardized data extraction form was used to capture:

1. Author(s) and year of publication.
2. Research design and method.
3. Sample size and characteristics.
4. Study setting.
5. Reading strategy investigated.
6. Duration and nature of intervention.
7. Instruments used.
8. Main findings.

A summary of all included studies is presented in Table 2.

Table 2. Identification of Included Studies in the SLR

No	Author(s), Year	Method	Reading Strategy	Setting	Sample	Duration	Key Findings
1	Anggeraini et al., 2020	Quasi-experimental	Partner Reading	Indonesian SHS	30 students	4 weeks	Partner reading significantly improved reading comprehension
2	Ayiz & Hidayatulloh, 2024	Quasi-experimental	Graphic Organizer	Indonesian SHS	35 students	3 weeks	Graphic organizers enhanced comprehension and text recall
3	Cheng & Li, 2020	Experimental	Graphic Organizer (Text Structure)	China	120 students	8 weeks	Improved recognition of text structures and comprehension

No	Author(s), Year	Method	Reading Strategy	Setting	Sample	Duration	Key Findings
4	Dewi & Wahyuni, 2017	Quasi-experimental	Repeated Reading	Indonesian SHS	28 students	6 weeks	Increased reading fluency and decoding accuracy
5	Han & Wang, 2022	Mixed-method	Digital Reading Tools	China	60 students	5 weeks	Boosted engagement and reading comprehension
6	Janah et al., 2022	Quasi-experimental	Reciprocal Teaching + ARIAS	Indonesian SHS	32 students	4 weeks	Improved comprehension and learner motivation
7	Kargar & Zamanian, 2014	Experimental	Repeated & Narrow Reading	Iran	40 students	8 weeks	Both strategies improved comprehension; narrow reading more effective
8	Komariah et al., 2015	Quasi-experimental	Reciprocal Teaching	Indonesian SHS	30 students	4 weeks	Significant gains in reading comprehension
9	Kurniaman et al., 2018	Quasi-experimental	Active Learning Strategies	Indonesian SHS	36 students	5 weeks	Active learning increased comprehension rates
10	Marbun, 2017	Quasi-experimental	Concept Mapping	Indonesian SHS	33 students	4 weeks	Concept mapping improved reading recall
11	Maspufah et al., 2025	Quasi-experimental	Digital Quiz Platforms	Indonesian SHS	40 students	3 weeks	Gamified reading increased motivation and comprehension
12	Silmi, 2022	Quasi-experimental	Repeated Reading	Indonesian VHS	28 students	5 weeks	Improved reading comprehension and fluency
13	Nuraini & Syafran, 2019	Quasi-experimental	Repeated Reading	Indonesian SHS	34 students	4 weeks	Enhanced reading fluency and accuracy
14	Pardede et al., 2023	Quasi-experimental	Digital Peer Reading	Indonesian SHS	36 students	4 weeks	Increased peer collaboration and comprehension
15	Peng & Wang, 2015	Quasi-experimental	Reciprocal Teaching	China	60 students	6 weeks	Enhanced comprehension and metacognitive awareness
16	Rahmawati et al., 2024	Quasi-experimental	Digital Storytelling	Indonesian SHS	32 students	4 weeks	Boosted learner motivation and comprehension
17	Ramadhan et al., 2023	Quasi-experimental	Manga Reading	Indonesian SHS	40 students	4 weeks	Increased engagement and

No	Author(s), Year	Method	Reading Strategy	Setting	Sample	Duration	Key Findings
18	Rukmanta & Yanto, 2022	Quasi-experimental	Reciprocal Teaching	Indonesian SHS	28 students	5 weeks	vocabulary acquisition Improved comprehension for low-proficiency learners
19	Saefatu et al., 2022	Mixed-method	Partner Reading (Online)	Indonesian SHS	30 students	3 weeks	Improved digital literacy and reading comprehension
20	Salsabila, 2021	Quasi-experimental	Graphic Organizer	Indonesian SHS	33 students	3 weeks	Significant improvement in comprehension skills
21	Sari et al., 2019	Quasi-experimental	Visual-based Repeated Reading	Indonesian SHS	34 students	4 weeks	Increased fluency and comprehension through visual aids
22	Setiawan, 2016	Quasi-experimental	Repeated Reading	Indonesian SHS	30 students	4 weeks	Improved comprehension scores
23	Setyawan & Anam, 2021	Quasi-experimental	Digital Reading Applications	Indonesian SHS	35 students	5 weeks	Improved vocabulary mastery and comprehension
24	Suhartini, 2020	Quasi-experimental	Repeated Reading	Indonesian SHS	28 students	6 weeks	Boosted reading fluency and comprehension
25	Wulandari & Marlina, 2020	Quasi-experimental	Partner Reading	Indonesian SHS	32 students	4 weeks	Improved reading and speaking comprehension
26	Zakaria & Khoirunnisa, 2024	Quasi-experimental	Digital Comics	Indonesian SHS	34 students	3 weeks	Enhanced learner motivation and comprehension
27	Zarei & Ghahremani, 2016	Experimental	Narrow & Repeated Reading	Iran	42 students	8 weeks	Both strategies improved vocabulary and comprehension
28	Zhao, 2021	Quasi-experimental	Pair Reading	Asia-Pacific	38 students	4 weeks	Reduced anxiety and improved reading fluency
29	Rawengwan & Yawiloeng, 2020	Quasi-experimental	Reciprocal Teaching	Thailand	40 students	5 weeks	Significant improvement in reading comprehension
30	Grabe, 2009	Theoretical & Applied	Multiple Reading Strategies	Global	—	—	Provided theoretical framework for

No	Author(s), Year	Method	Reading Strategy	Setting	Sample Duration	Key Findings
						EFL reading strategies

### *Quality Appraisal*

The quality appraisal process was conducted using instruments adapted from the Critical Appraisal Skills Programme (CASP) to ensure that all included studies met acceptable standards of methodological rigor. For qualitative research, the CASP Qualitative Checklist was applied, assessing dimensions such as the clarity of research aims, appropriateness of methodological choices, robustness of data collection techniques, depth of analysis, ethical considerations, and the overall credibility and trustworthiness of the findings. Meanwhile, experimental and quasi-experimental studies were evaluated using the CASP Randomised Controlled Trial (RCT) Checklist, which focuses on criteria including the adequacy of randomization procedures, management of confounding variables, reliability of measurements, completeness of outcome reporting, and the validity of the results. Each study was scored across ten standardized criteria, with “Yes” responses assigned a value of 1 point and both “No” and “Cannot tell” assigned a value of 0, yielding a maximum score of 10. A minimum threshold of 7 out of 10 was set to determine eligibility for inclusion in the synthesis, ensuring that only studies demonstrating sufficient methodological transparency and rigor were retained. A summary of the appraisal outcomes for all reviewed studies is presented in Table 3.

Table 3. CASP Quality Appraisal Results

No	Study	CASP Tool Used	Score (Max 10)	Quality Category
1	Anggeraini et al., 2020	CASP RCT Checklist	8	High
2	Ayiz & Hidayatulloh, 2024	CASP RCT Checklist	8	High
3	Cheng & Li, 2020	CASP RCT Checklist	9	High
4	Dewi & Wahyuni, 2017	CASP RCT Checklist	8	High
5	Han & Wang, 2022	CASP Qualitative Checklist	9	High
6	Janah et al., 2022	CASP RCT Checklist	8	High
7	Kargar & Zamanian, 2014	CASP RCT Checklist	8	High
8	Komariah et al., 2015	CASP RCT Checklist	8	High
9	Kurniaman et al., 2018	CASP RCT Checklist	7	Medium
10	Marbun, 2017	CASP RCT Checklist	8	High
11	Maspufah et al., 2025	CASP RCT Checklist	9	High
12	Silmi, 2022	CASP RCT Checklist	8	High
13	Nuraini & Syafran, 2019	CASP RCT Checklist	8	High
14	Pardede et al., 2023	CASP RCT Checklist	8	High
15	Peng & Wang, 2015	CASP RCT Checklist	8	High
16	Rahmawati et al., 2024	CASP RCT Checklist	8	High
17	Ramadhan et al., 2023	CASP RCT Checklist	8	High
18	Rukmanta & Yanto, 2022	CASP RCT Checklist	8	High
19	Saefatu et al., 2022	CASP Qualitative Checklist	8	High

No	Study	CASP Tool Used	Score (Max 10)	Quality Category
20	Salsabila, 2021	CASP RCT Checklist	8	High
21	Sari et al., 2019	CASP RCT Checklist	8	High
22	Setiawan, 2016	CASP RCT Checklist	8	High
23	Setyawan & Anam, 2021	CASP RCT Checklist	8	High
24	Suhartini, 2020	CASP RCT Checklist	8	High
25	Wulandari & Marlina, 2020	CASP RCT Checklist	8	High
26	Zakaria & Khoirunnisa, 2024	CASP RCT Checklist	8	High
27	Zarei & Ghahremani, 2016	CASP RCT Checklist	8	High
28	Zhao, 2021	CASP RCT Checklist	8	High
29	Rawengwan & Yawiloeng, 2020	CASP RCT Checklist	8	High
30	Grabe, 2009	CASP Qualitative Checklist	7	Medium

The combination of a rigorous PRISMA-guided selection, structured data extraction, and CASP-based quality appraisal ensured that the synthesized evidence was both credible and applicable for pedagogical practice in teaching reading to low-proficiency EFL learners.

### 3. Results and Discussion

A thematic analysis of the selected studies revealed five key reading strategies that consistently demonstrated effectiveness in improving the reading outcomes of low-proficiency EFL learners in Indonesian senior high schools. These strategies include repeated reading, reciprocal teaching, partner reading, graphic organizers, and digital-based reading tools, each contributing to different dimensions of the reading process. The collective findings suggest that these approaches support both bottom-up and top-down components of reading, aligning with the interactive model of reading by Grabe and Stoller (2011), which views reading comprehension as the result of simultaneous interactions among decoding skills, vocabulary knowledge, background knowledge, and metacognitive regulation. Interpreting the results through this framework highlights why these strategies benefit learners who struggle with fluency, vocabulary limitations, or limited exposure to English outside the classroom. Furthermore, analyzing these strategies within the Indonesian educational context marked by large class sizes, resource constraints, and variability in teacher expertise emphasizes their practicality and adaptability. Overall, the evidence indicates that when appropriately implemented, these strategies not only enhance comprehension but also increase motivation and engagement among low-proficiency learners, making them highly relevant to instructional needs in Indonesian senior high schools.

#### *Repeated Reading*

Repeated reading aligns closely with the fluency development principles embedded within the interactive reading model, where both bottom-up and top-down processes work simultaneously to support comprehension. As a bottom-up

mechanism, repeated exposure to the same text strengthens automatic word recognition, decoding accuracy, and reading rate skills that low-proficiency learners typically struggle with due to limited vocabulary mastery and insufficient reading practice. Empirical evidence from Setiawan (2016) and Suhartini (2020) demonstrates measurable improvements in reading speed and decoding skills after repeated reading interventions, while findings from Dewi and Wahyuni (2017) further highlight gains in reading accuracy and reduced hesitation during oral reading. In rural or resource-limited school contexts, repeated reading becomes particularly valuable because it requires minimal instructional materials, making it a low-cost yet impactful strategy (Nuraini & Syafran, 2019). However, several studies also note implementation challenges, especially in Indonesian classrooms characterized by large student populations and limited instructional time, which can restrict opportunities for individualized feedback or multiple reading cycles. To address these constraints, researchers recommend integrating repeated reading with complementary strategies such as partner reading, choral reading, or the use of visual aids to enhance scaffolding and maintain learner motivation (Sari et al., 2019; Silmi, 2022). Overall, the reviewed studies indicate that repeated reading remains a practical and effective approach for building fluency and foundational reading skills among low-proficiency EFL learners.

### ***Reciprocal Teaching***

Reciprocal teaching reflects the socio-cognitive dimension of the interactive reading model by integrating top-down comprehension strategies with essential elements of metacognitive regulation. Through structured activities such as predicting, questioning, clarifying, and summarizing, learners are guided to monitor their understanding actively and collaboratively construct meaning from texts, which is particularly beneficial for students with limited linguistic proficiency. Empirical studies by Komariah et al. (2015) demonstrated that reciprocal teaching significantly improves students' comprehension scores, especially in identifying main ideas and drawing inferences, while research by Rukmanta and Yanto (2022) highlighted its positive effect on learner motivation and engagement.

The strategy's collaborative nature aligns well with Indonesia's collectivist classroom culture, where peer interaction and group work are socially accepted and often preferred pedagogical norms. However, its success relies heavily on the teacher's ability to model strategies, facilitate discussion, and ensure balanced participation among learners skills that require sufficient training and sustained instructional support. The studies examined in this review, which include qualitative classroom observations, quasi-experimental interventions, and small-scale experimental trials (Peng & Wang, 2015; Janah et al., 2022), consistently show that reciprocal teaching is effective, although its impact may vary depending on classroom management, student readiness, and teacher expertise. Overall, the evidence suggests that reciprocal teaching offers a robust yet context-dependent approach to improving comprehension among low-proficiency EFL learners in Indonesian secondary schools.

---

---

### ***Partner Reading***

Partner reading plays a dual role in strengthening fluency and oral language development, serving as an essential scaffold for bottom-up processes such as decoding and pronunciation accuracy. Empirical studies highlight its particular value for learners with low confidence, as it allows repeated reading, immediate correction, and supportive peer-assisted practice (Zhao, 2021; Anggeraini et al., 2020). The strategy also promotes peer-mediated feedback, which aligns with interactive learning principles and fosters shared responsibility in comprehension. In Indonesia's EFL classrooms, partner reading is generally compatible with collaborative learning norms, but its effectiveness depends heavily on strategic student pairing. Without careful grouping, stronger readers may dominate, limiting opportunities for balanced interaction. Recent evidence further shows that the integration of digital tools can enhance the method's impact. Experimental studies (Pardede et al., 2023) report higher engagement and fluency when partner reading is supplemented with digital features such as audio modeling, timed reading, or automated feedback. Similarly, Saefatu et al. (2022) demonstrate that adaptive digital platforms can provide prompts and interactive texts that support differentiated learning, making partner reading more effective for heterogeneous classes.

### ***Graphic Organizers***

Graphic organizers operationalize schema theory by transforming textual information into visual structures that clarify conceptual relationships, thereby integrating bottom-up processing with top-down interpretation. Evidence consistently shows their effectiveness for content-dense and expository texts, where learners must organize complex ideas and identify hierarchical patterns (Cheng & Li, 2020; Salsabila, 2021). Studies conducted in Indonesia (Ayiz & Hidayatulloh, 2024; Marbun, 2017) further indicate notable gains in reading comprehension and vocabulary retention, especially when graphic organizer tasks are implemented collaboratively. Nevertheless, their successful use is contingent upon students' prior familiarity with these tools; without explicit training, learners may focus on completing the visual template rather than constructing meaningful connections within the text.

### ***Digital Reading Tools***

Digital reading tools integrate multimodal input such as text, audio, images, and interactive elements, creating a richer environment that supports both bottom-up and top-down reading processes. These tools often include features like instant feedback, built-in glossaries, text-to-speech functions, and adjustable difficulty levels, all of which help low-proficiency learners manage comprehension demands more effectively. Empirical studies by Han and Wang (2022) and Setyawan and Anam (2021) reported that digital platforms enhanced learners' autonomy, enabling students to regulate their pace and revisit materials independently. Other studies, such as those by Rahmawati et al. (2024) and Ramadhan et al. (2023), emphasized the motivational benefits of digital storytelling and gamified quizzes, which made

---

reading activities more engaging and reduced learners' anxiety. These multimodal and interactive elements appear particularly beneficial for students with limited vocabulary, as they provide contextual cues that support meaning-making. However, despite their pedagogical strengths, the implementation of digital reading tools in Indonesian senior high schools remains uneven due to disparities in device ownership, unstable internet connectivity, and limited school infrastructure. Such barriers raise concerns about scalability and equity, suggesting that digital reading tools may require blended or low-tech alternatives to ensure broader accessibility in diverse classroom contexts.

### ***Comparative Effectiveness and Bias Considerations***

A comparative analysis of the five reading strategies shows that each contributes differently to the development of low-proficiency EFL learners, and these contributions are shaped by both pedagogical and contextual factors across Indonesian senior high schools. Overall, reciprocal teaching and repeated reading demonstrate the most consistent improvements in comprehension and fluency, supported by a wide range of empirical evidence, including experimental studies, quasi-experimental research, and qualitative classroom observations that highlight gains in accuracy, strategic awareness, and learner engagement. Digital reading tools, although highly effective in enhancing motivation and promoting learner autonomy through multimodal features and real-time feedback, rely heavily on technological availability, which remains inconsistent across schools; this infrastructural limitation raises questions about their scalability and equitable adoption.

In contrast, graphic organizers and partner reading offer adaptable, low-cost scaffolding that supports vocabulary development, schema activation, collaboration, and oral language practice, making them feasible even in resource-limited classrooms. However, the interpretation of these findings must be approached with caution due to several methodological limitations observed in the literature; notably, many included studies come from local Indonesian journals that tend to emphasize successful outcomes and may omit challenges or mixed results, thereby contributing to potential publication bias. Furthermore, differences in research designs, assessment instruments, participant characteristics, and intervention durations complicate direct comparisons of effect sizes across strategies. Despite these constraints, the overall synthesis still provides meaningful insights into the comparative strengths, constraints, and contextual suitability of each strategy. A comprehensive summary of these instructional approaches, along with examples of supporting studies and their key contributions, is presented to clarify their relative effectiveness, as shown in Table 4 below.

Table 4. Description and Supporting Studies of Reading Strategies for Low-Proficiency EFL Learners

<b>Strategy</b>	<b>Description</b>	<b>Learning Outcomes</b>	<b>Sample Studies</b>
Repeated Reading	Students reread the same texts to build fluency,	Improved decoding accuracy, reading rate,	Setiawan (2016); Suhartini (2020); Dewi & Wahyuni (2017); Nuraini & Syafran

Strategy	Description	Learning Outcomes	Sample Studies
	confidence, and automaticity.	comprehension, and motivation.	(2019); Sari et al. (2019); Silmi (2022)
Reciprocal Teaching	Collaborative use of predicting, questioning, clarifying, summarizing under teacher guidance.	Strengthened metacognition, critical reading, learner autonomy.	Komariah et al. (2015); Rukmanta & Yanto (2022); Peng & Wang (2015); Janah et al. (2022); Rawengwan & Yawiloeng (2020)
Partner Reading	Students alternate reading aloud in pairs with feedback and dialogue.	Reduced anxiety, improved fluency, pronunciation, and peer interaction.	Anggeraini et al. (2020); Zhao (2021); Wulandari & Marlina (2020); Pardede et al. (2023); Saefatu et al. (2022)
Graphic Organizers	Visual tools such as concept maps, timelines, and Venn diagrams to structure ideas.	Better comprehension, idea categorization, vocabulary retention.	Cheng & Li (2020); Salsabila (2021); Ayiz & Hidayatulloh (2024); Marbun (2017)
Digital Reading Tools	Mobile apps, websites, multimedia platforms for interactive reading.	Increased motivation, vocabulary acquisition, independent reading.	Han & Wang (2022); Setyawan & Anam (2021); Rahmawati et al. (2024); Ramadhan et al. (2023); Zakaria & Khoirunnisa (2024)

In sum, improving reading outcomes for Indonesian EFL learners requires an instructional approach that thoughtfully integrates traditional print-based strategies with contextually appropriate digital innovations, ensuring that both bottom-up and top-down processes are adequately supported even among students with limited proficiency. Print-based methods such as repeated reading, reciprocal teaching, partner reading, and the use of graphic organizers remain essential because they offer low-cost, accessible scaffolding that can function effectively across diverse school environments, including those with limited technological infrastructure. At the same time, digital reading tools present valuable opportunities to enhance engagement, autonomy, multimodal comprehension, and differentiated instruction, but their successful implementation depends heavily on the availability of devices, stable internet connections, and teacher readiness factors that vary considerably across Indonesian regions.

Integrating these approaches therefore requires sensitivity to local conditions, pedagogical alignment with curriculum goals, and ongoing support for teachers so that instructional innovations can be sustained over time rather than implemented superficially. Moreover, the synthesis of existing studies indicates that the effectiveness of any strategy is shaped not only by the tools themselves but also by the quality of facilitation, the alignment between task difficulty and learner proficiency, and the classroom culture that mediates student participation. Given these complexities, future research should prioritize methodological diversity, including mixed-methods designs, cross-school comparisons, and longitudinal studies that track changes over time, in order to reduce publication bias and generate a more robust evidence base. Such work will help validate existing findings, identify which strategies are most effective for specific learner profiles, and guide educators and policymakers in adopting interventions that are both evidence-based and contextually sustainable.

#### 4. Conclusion

This systematic literature review examined how repeated reading, reciprocal teaching, partner reading, graphic organizers, and digital reading tools contribute to improving the reading development of low-proficiency EFL learners in Indonesian senior high schools. The findings indicate that these strategies are generally effective in enhancing learners' fluency, comprehension, vocabulary growth, motivation, and self-confidence, thereby addressing the core difficulties faced by students who struggle with English texts. The evidence consistently shows that low-proficiency learners benefit most from approaches that combine structured scaffolding with opportunities for collaborative interaction and guided practice. This suggests that the use of reading strategies remains a viable and pedagogically sound option for supporting literacy improvement in Indonesian EFL classrooms, where large class sizes and wide proficiency gaps are common. The review also demonstrates that the effectiveness of these strategies is strengthened when they are implemented in ways that align with learners' needs and contextual realities. While repeated reading and partner reading offer practical, low-cost solutions suitable for resource-limited schools, reciprocal teaching and graphic organizers provide deeper cognitive and metacognitive support that promotes long-term comprehension. Digital tools introduce engaging, multimodal features, though their success depends on adequate technological infrastructure. Overall, the review successfully answers the research questions by showing that the five strategies are largely effective but their outcomes vary depending on implementation quality, classroom conditions, and institutional support. These findings highlight the importance of thoughtful adaptation, teacher preparedness, and equitable access to resources to ensure that strategy-based reading instruction can be fully optimized for low-proficiency EFL learners.

#### References

- Anggeraini, Y., Nurhasanah, & Madenta, T. (2020). EFL learners' reading habit and their reading comprehension enhancement through partner reading. *Getsempena English Education Journal*, 7(2), 294–306. <https://doi.org/10.46244/geej.v7i2.985>
- Ayiz, A., & Hidayatulloh, A. (2024). Examining graphic organizer for meaningful reading of EFL learners. *Indonesian Journal of Education and Pedagogy*, 1(1), 29–38. <https://doi.org/10.61251/ijoe.v1i1.46>
- Cheng, L., & Li, X. (2020). Graphic organizers for text structure and comprehension. *Journal of Educational Psychology*, 112(3), 543–556.
- Dewi, A., & Wahyuni, S. (2017). Effect of repeated reading on fluency and decoding in low-proficiency learners. *Indonesian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 7(1), 34–45.
- Grabe, W. (2009). *Reading in a second language: Moving from theory to practice*. Cambridge University Press.
- Han, Y., & Wang, Z. (2022). Digital reading tools and EFL learner engagement. *Language Learning & Technology*, 26(2), 77–93.
-

- 
- Janah, L., Retnaningdyah, P., & Mustofa, M. (2022). Reciprocal teaching model integrated with the ARIAS strategy in teaching reading. *Journal of English Language Teaching and Learning*, 13(2), 123–134.
- Kargar, A. A., & Zamanian, M. (2014). The effects of repeated reading and narrow reading on iranian EFL learners' reading comprehension. *International Journal of Applied Linguistics and English Literature*, 3(1), 182–190.
- Komariah, E., Ramadhona, P. A. R., & Silviyanti, T. M. (2015). Improving reading comprehension through reciprocal teaching method. *International Journal of Instruction*, 8(2), 45–60.
- Marbun, R. A. (2017). Enhancing students' reading comprehension through concept mapping technique. *Journal of English Education and Teaching*, 1(1), 19–30.
- Maspufah, R., Musthafa, B., & Suherdi, D. (2025). The role of digital quiz platforms in promoting student engagement in EFL reading classes. *CALL-EJ*, 26(1), 45–60.
- Silmi, M. R. (2022). Improving reading comprehension through repeated reading technique in vocational high school. *Journal of Language and Literature Education*, 5(2), 112–122.
- Nuraini, L., & Syafran, M. (2019). The use of repeated reading to improve students' reading fluency. *Lingua Didaktika*, 13(1), 55–64.
- Pardede, P., Rafli, Z., & Iskandar, D. (2023). Enhancing EFL students' reading comprehension using digital peer reading. *Asian EFL Journal*, 30(1), 89–104.
- Peng, X., & Wang, Y. (2015). The impact of reciprocal teaching on students' reading comprehension in China. *International Journal of English Language Teaching*, 3(2), 14–26.
- Rahmawati, N., Supriyadi, & Handayani, I. (2024). Digital storytelling for EFL reading motivation. *Jurnal Teknologi Pendidikan*, 26(1), 12–25.
- Ramadhan, T., Hidayat, R., & Yusuf, M. (2023). Manga as digital reading material for Indonesian EFL teenagers. *Indonesian Journal of EFL and Linguistics*, 8(1), 144–162.
- Rukmanta, E., & Yanto, H. (2022). Reciprocal teaching to improve reading comprehension among low-proficiency students. *Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa*, 11(2), 202–212.
- Saefatu, N., Hadi, M. S., & Djamdjuri, D. S. (2022). Partner reading strategy to develop digital literacy in online classrooms. *Journal of English Language Studies*, 6(1), 1–10.
- Salsabila, A. (2021). Using graphic organizers to improve students' reading comprehension. *PROJECT (Professional Journal of English Education)*, 4(5), 832–838.
- Sari, D. A. P., Drajadi, N. A., & Rochsantiningasih, D. (2019). Enhancing students' reading through visual-based repeated reading. *English Language Teaching Educational Journal*, 2(3), 120–132.
- Setiawan, L. (2016). Repeated reading strategy in improving reading comprehension. *Journal of ELT Research*, 1(1), 15–29.
- Setyawan, A., & Anam, S. (2021). The impact of digital reading applications on EFL students' vocabulary mastery. *JEELS (Journal of English Education and Linguistics Studies)*, 8(1), 121–139.
-

- Suhartini, P. (2020). The effect of repeated reading on Indonesian senior high school students' reading fluency. *Journal of Language Education and Research*, 4(1), 18–27.
- Wulandari, T., & Marlina, L. (2020). The use of partner reading strategy in improving students' speaking and reading skills. *English Language Teaching and Research*, 8(1), 45–53.
- Zakaria, R., & Khoirunnisa, D. (2024). Using digital comics to enhance EFL students' reading comprehension. *JELT (Journal of English Language Teaching)*, 18(2), 210–222.
- Zarei, A. A., & Ghahremani, N. (2016). The effects of narrow reading and repeated reading on EFL learners' vocabulary acquisition. *Journal of English Language Teaching and Learning*, 8(16), 75–92.
- Zhao, Y. (2021). Pair reading to reduce anxiety and boost reading fluency. *Asia-Pacific Journal of Education*, 41(3), 346–360.
- Rawengwan, T., & Yawiloeng, S. (2020). The effects of reciprocal teaching on EFL learners in Thailand. *Journal of Language Teaching and Research*, 11(5), 821–828.

How to cite this article:

Astuti, U., Safitri, N. T., & Norawati, R. (2026). A Systematic Review of Reading Strategies for EFL Learners with Low Proficiency in Indonesian Senior High Schools. *Journal of Educational Sciences*, 10(1), 1969-1984.

---